1-26-2017

How long does savings last when retirees need more money (or less) than conventional wisdom suggests?

Steven J. Welch
College of St. Benedict & St. John's University, swelch@csbsju.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.csbsju.edu/forum_lectures

Part of the Finance and Financial Management Commons

Recommended Citation
Welch, Steven J., "How long does savings last when retirees need more money (or less) than conventional wisdom suggests?" (2017). Forum Lectures. 168.
http://digitalcommons.csbsju.edu/forum_lectures/168

This Presentation is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@CSB/SJU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Forum Lectures by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@CSB/SJU. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@csbsju.edu.
How Long Does Savings Last When Retirees Need More Money (or Less) than Theory Suggests?

Steve Welch
Department of Accounting & Finance
Retiree Risk

- Volatility of investment risk
  - Standard deviation of returns
  - Statistical measurement, academic

- Longevity risk
  - Hard to quantify
  - Not academic
Longevity Risk and Human/Financial Capital

- Life Cycle and the risk/return trade-off
  - Younger investors
    - Willing to bear more risk for higher returns
  - Older investors
    - Willing to accept lower returns for lower risk

Greater Human Capital

Greater Financial Capital
4% Rule Example

• At retirement, you have $1,000,000 in retirement savings

• 1\textsuperscript{st} year of retirement:
  • Withdraw $40,000.00
  • Inflation that year is 2.4%

• 2\textsuperscript{nd} year of retirement:
  • Withdraw $40,000 \times 1.024 = $40,960.00
  • Inflation that year is 3.2%

• 3\textsuperscript{rd} year of retirement:
  • Withdraw $40,960 \times 1.032 = $42,270.72
  • Continue this procedure indefinitely
The 4% Convention

• Withdraw 4% of retirement funds for the first year of retirement
  • Base withdrawal amount

• Increase the amount annually with inflation

• Savings will normally last for at least 30 years
  • Some exposure to stock is required (40% or more)

• Rule of thumb, very rigid
  • Does not allow for any flexibility
  • Many retirees have unique circumstances

• 4% has been questioned as too high in our low rate environment
More Flexibility

• Withdraw initial amounts varying between 2% and 10%

• Allow for 1 or 2-asset portfolios
  • 10% increments (0-100%)

• Determine how long savings will survive
  • Percentage of portfolios not running out of money

• Check survival rate in 5-year increments
  • 5 years to 40 years

• Use real data from 1934 – 2015
Data

- Small Cap stocks, Midcap stocks, Large cap stocks, T-bonds, T-bills
  - Kenneth French Data Library
  - Federal Reserve Economic Data (FRED)

- Increased withdrawal amount each year using previous year CPI-U

- Data from 1934 – 2015
Methodology

• 1- and 2-asset portfolios of the 5 assets in 10% increments
  • 95 distinct portfolios (e.g. 30% midcaps/70% T-bonds)

• 2 – 10% initial withdrawal amounts
  • Base dollar amount
  • Increased by inflation from previous year

• Rolling 5-, 10-, 15-, 20-, 25-, 30-, 35-, and 40-year periods
  • 78, 73, 68, 63, 58, 53, 48, and 43 rolling periods (1934-2015)

• Determine survival rate
  • Percentage of rolling periods that do not run out of money

• Taxes not considered
# Correlation Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset</th>
<th>SmCap</th>
<th>MidCap</th>
<th>LgCap</th>
<th>10yTBond</th>
<th>TBill(Cash)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SmCap</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MidCap</td>
<td>0.9309</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LgCap</td>
<td>0.8081</td>
<td>0.9467</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10yTBond</td>
<td>-0.1978</td>
<td>-0.1143</td>
<td>-0.0557</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBill(Cash)</td>
<td>-0.1413</td>
<td>-0.0901</td>
<td>-0.0470</td>
<td>0.2864</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Descriptive Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset</th>
<th>E(R)</th>
<th>STD. DEV.</th>
<th>CV</th>
<th>SHARPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SmCap</td>
<td>20.47%</td>
<td>34.99%</td>
<td>1.7091</td>
<td>0.4833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MidCap</td>
<td>15.46%</td>
<td>24.11%</td>
<td>1.5591</td>
<td>0.4936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LgCap</td>
<td>13.01%</td>
<td>19.20%</td>
<td>1.4751</td>
<td>0.4923</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10yTBond</td>
<td>5.40%</td>
<td>8.23%</td>
<td>1.5238</td>
<td>0.2233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBill(Cash)</td>
<td>3.56%</td>
<td>3.15%</td>
<td>0.8837</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Best Risk-Return (Highest Sharpe) Survival

- 7 (of 95) Portfolios had Sharpe Ratios of >0.5500
- Best was 30% Small Cap, 70% T-bonds (0.5818)
  - \( E(r) = 9.92\% \) over the 82-year period
- 2-3% withdrawal rates: nearly 100% survival
- 4% withdrawal rate: Acceptable survival at 40 years (95%)
- 5% withdrawal rate: Acceptable survival at 30 years (89%)
- 6% withdrawal rate: Acceptable survival at 20 years (89%)
- 7-10% withdrawal rates: Acceptable only at <= 10 years
2% Withdrawal Rate Survival

• Everything survives for 40 years except combinations of T-bonds and T-bills

• Combinations of T-bonds and T-bills have some probability of failing after 30 years

• Any combination with at least 10% stock survives for the entire period

• No need for a financial advisor for this one
  • If your only goal is to be sure your money survives
3% Withdrawal Rate *Survival*

- 100% chance of 25-year survival with at least 10% invested in stocks (any-cap)
- 89% chance or greater of 30-, 35-, and 40-year survival with at least 10% invested in stocks
- Some portfolio combinations survived for 40 years
- Not likely to run out of money if you only need 2-3% initial withdrawal rate from your retirement savings
4% Withdrawal Rate **Survival**

- This is the conventionally recommended rate
- 4 portfolio combinations that survive for 30 years 100% of the time
  - 30-40% small cap stocks, 70-60% T-bills
  - 30-40% midcap stocks, 70-60% T-bills
- No 100% guarantees at 35- or 40-year horizons
- Stocks are necessary to include in retirement portfolio if 4% or more initial withdrawal rate is desired and assets expected to last for more than 20 years
- If retirement savings survival of 30 or more years is required, the 4% convention seems to reflect reality
5% Withdrawal Rate Survival

- Survival rates with withdrawal rates ≥ 5% get more complex
- Some 100% survival rates at 15-year horizon
- Many >90% survival rates at 20-year horizon
- Some portfolio combinations had >90% survival rates for 25-, 30-, 35-, and 40-year horizons
  - 70% small cap stocks / 30% T-bonds survived for 40 years 95% of the time
- Many all-stock portfolios survive longer than those with bonds, but some portfolios with bonds did well
6% Withdrawal Rate **Survival**

- Stock component is necessary for an acceptable probability of a >20 year survival rate
  - All-bond combinations survived <30% of the time

- Best combinations
  - 20 Years: 60% SmCap/40% T-bonds (97%)
  - 25 Years: 80% SmCap/20% T-bonds, or 90% SmCap/10% T-bills (95%)
  - 30 Years: 90% SmCap/10% T-bonds or T-bills (93%)
  - 35 Years: 90% SmCap/10% T-bonds (92%)
  - 40 Years: 80-100% SmCap/0-20% T-bonds or T-bills (88%)
    - 5 Combinations
7% Withdrawal Rate Survival

• Many 15-year survival rates are good (>90%)

• The best 20-, 25-, 30-, and 35-year survival rates are 80-90%, which is starting to get risky
  • All of the best survival rates had allocations to small cap stocks of at least 50%, but mostly higher

• The best 40-year survival rate was 79%
  • All had a 60-100% allocation to small cap stocks

• Portfolios with large portions of bonds and bills rarely survived 15 years
8% Withdrawal Rate Survival

- 10-year survival rates are mostly good (>90%)
- 15 and 20-year survival rates may be acceptable (>85%) for the best portfolio combinations
- Survival rates for portfolio combinations with horizons of 25 years or more are only around 80% (+/- 3%)
  - 25 Years: 80% SmCap/20% Large Caps (83%)
  - 30 Years: 90% SmCap/10% Midcaps or Large caps (77%)
  - 35 Years: 100% SmCap; or 90% SmCap/10% T-bills (79%)
  - 40 Years: 100% SmCap (79%)
9% Withdrawal Rate **Survival**

- No portfolios had 100% survival rates at 10 years
  - Best combinations at 10 years: 30-50% small cap stocks combined with 70-50% T-bills
    - Survived 95% of the time and included a large chunk of T-bills
    - Relatively short time horizon
- Best portfolio combinations at other time horizons:
  - 15 years: 50-80% SmCap/20-50% other stocks or T-bonds (85%)
  - 20 years: 70% SmCap/30% Large Caps (79%)
  - 25 years: 100% Small Cap stocks (71%)
  - 30, 35, and 40 years: 90-100% SmCap/0-10% Midcap or LargeCap (64-65%)
    - 80% small caps and 20% midcaps also tied for best at 35 years
- Consider delaying retirement if horizon >15 years
10% Withdrawal Rate **Survival**

- Not all 5-year horizons survived (but almost all)
- 10- and 15-year horizons may be acceptable
  - Best survival rates are 89% for 10 years and 79% for 15 years
  - 40-70% SmCap/60-30% T-bonds (best 10-year portfolios)
  - 90% SmCap/10% LargeCap (best 15-year portfolio)
- Survival rates for portfolios of 20 years or more were all lower than 2/3 chance of survival
  - 1 in 3 chance of failure
  - All of the best portfolios had large allocations to small cap stocks
- **NOT** recommended for horizons longer than 10 years under normal circumstances, or 15 years under extraordinary circumstances
General Recommendations

• If you only need 2-4% withdrawal rate, you're unlikely to run out of money as long as you have some allocation to stocks.

• For 5-6% withdrawal rates, a significant allocation to stocks is necessary if your time horizon is longer than 15 years.

• For 7-10% withdrawal rates, a delayed retirement is a good option if possible. If not, careful allocations and high tolerance to risk (volatility of returns) are necessary for longer time horizons.

• Small cap stocks are important in all of the higher withdrawal rates.
  • A combination of a small cap ETF and microcap ETF would approximately replicate this portfolio.

• Retirees must balance the risk of investment volatility with the risk of running out of money too soon.
Caveat & Future Directions

• This study shows past performance and survival rates
  • The future may be different... However...
    • Never underestimate the past

Future Avenues of Research (Things I didn’t do)
1. Increase the potential portfolio choices to include three-, four-, or five-asset portfolios.
2. Include international assets, corporate bonds, and/or high-yield bonds as potential choices for the portfolio.
3. Look at variable withdrawal scenarios, including increasing withdrawal rates and declining withdrawal rates throughout retirement.
Thank you!